

Message

From: Lavoie, Emma [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=86AC7844F12646C095E4E9093A941623-LAVOIE, EMMA]
Sent: 1/13/2022 11:56:57 PM
To: Gross-Davis, CarolAnn [Gross-Davis.CarolAnn@epa.gov]
CC: D'Amico, Louis [DAmico.Louis@epa.gov]
Subject: FW: Presentation on Cumulative Risk
Attachments: EJ Intro Mixtures and Cumulative RA Module 3 v3.ppt; SRA EJ Workshop Module3 EPA's CRA Guidelines.pptx; Geller SRA Cumul Assess Wkshp Dec 2021 final.pdf

CarolAnn,

Do you have the attached? If not, Andrew Geller sent as a resource.
I have not reviewed but they were for public conference.

-Emma

Emma T. Lavoie, PhD
Tel: 703.472.6312

From: Geller, Andrew <Geller.Andrew@epa.gov>
Sent: Friday, January 7, 2022 12:01 PM
To: Paul, Sean <paul.sean@epa.gov>; Frey, Christopher <Frey.Christopher@epa.gov>; Ross, Mary <Ross.Mary@epa.gov>; Gwinn, Maureen <gwinn.maureen@epa.gov>; Rodan, Bruce <rodan.bruce@epa.gov>
Cc: D'Amico, Louis <DAmico.Louis@epa.gov>; Julius, Susan <Julius.Susan@epa.gov>; Blackburn, Elizabeth <Blackburn.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Lavoie, Emma <Lavoie.Emma@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Presentation on Cumulative Risk

Sorry to be slow in weighing in this. Last month at Society for Risk Analysis, Lawrence Martin and Glenn Rice did a good presentation on cumulative risk assessment and mixtures analysis – you may want to use their slides as is or as a basis for a new slide deck. I also presented there, discussing cumulative assessment from an EJ perspective. I've attached Lawrence and Glenn's slides along with my slides here.

Andrew

From: Paul, Sean paul.sean@epa.gov
Sent: Friday, January 07, 2022 11:29 AM
To: Frey, Christopher Frey.Christopher@epa.gov; Ross, Mary Ross.Mary@epa.gov; Gwinn, Maureen gwinn.maureen@epa.gov; Rodan, Bruce rodan.bruce@epa.gov
Cc: D'Amico, Louis DAmico.Louis@epa.gov; Julius, Susan Julius.Susan@epa.gov; Geller, Andrew Geller.Andrew@epa.gov; Blackburn, Elizabeth Blackburn.Elizabeth@epa.gov; Lavoie, Emma Lavoie.Emma@epa.gov
Subject: RE: Presentation on Cumulative Risk

Got it. I'll respond to Region 3 and connect them with Emma.

Sean J. Paul (he/him/his)
US Environmental Protection Agency
Office of Research and Development
Office: (202)564-7099 | Cell: (202)695-6513

From: Frey, Christopher <Frey.Christopher@epa.gov>

Sent: Friday, January 7, 2022 11:22 AM

To: Paul, Sean <paul.sean@epa.gov>; Ross, Mary <Ross.Mary@epa.gov>; Gwinn, Maureen <gwinn.maureen@epa.gov>; Rodan, Bruce <rodan.bruce@epa.gov>

Cc: D'Amico, Louis <DAmico.Louis@epa.gov>; Julius, Susan <Julius.Susan@epa.gov>; Geller, Andrew <Geller.Andrew@epa.gov>; Blackburn, Elizabeth <Blackburn.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Lavoie, Emma <Lavoie.Emma@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: Presentation on Cumulative Risk

The IOAA discussed this morning. Emma will coordinate on this, and we discussed reaching out to Lou, OAR (both air toxics/NATA/NESHAP and EJ points of contact), and OP (Phil Fine) – the latter two are better able address adjacent policy issues that seem implied by some of the questions and would be likely to come up anyway. It is not entirely clear to me if CRA vs. CIA would be the more salient focus. To state the obvious, we want to stay in our science “swim lane” on this.

Chris

From: Paul, Sean <paul.sean@epa.gov>

Sent: Thursday, January 6, 2022 11:33 PM

To: Ross, Mary <Ross.Mary@epa.gov>; Gwinn, Maureen <gwinn.maureen@epa.gov>; Frey, Christopher <Frey.Christopher@epa.gov>; Rodan, Bruce <rodan.bruce@epa.gov>

Cc: D'Amico, Louis <DAmico.Louis@epa.gov>; Julius, Susan <Julius.Susan@epa.gov>; Geller, Andrew <Geller.Andrew@epa.gov>; Blackburn, Elizabeth <Blackburn.Elizabeth@epa.gov>

Subject: FW: Presentation on Cumulative Risk

Hello Chris/Bruce/Maureen/Mary

See below a request for tech support from a colleague in Region 3. The City of Philadelphia is asking Region 3 to provide a briefing on the state of the science on Cumulative Risk Assessment and would like ORD's help putting the slides together. The virtual presentation is on January 27.

How would you like to proceed with this? A big wrinkle worth noting is that Earthjustice seems to be involved as well...

Sean J. Paul (he/him/his)

US Environmental Protection Agency

Office of Research and Development

Office: (202)564-7099 | Cell: (202)695-6513

From: Gross-Davis, CarolAnn <Gross-Davis.CarolAnn@epa.gov>

Sent: Wednesday, January 5, 2022 3:24 PM

To: Gwinn, Maureen <gwinn.maureen@epa.gov>; Paul, Sean <paul.sean@epa.gov>

Subject: FW: Presentation on Cumulative Risk

Maureen and Sean,

I currently serve as the EPA liaison and sit on the Air Pollution Control Board in the Department of Public Health for the City of Philadelphia. The City is trying to pass an air toxics permit regulation that requires a risk assessment for air toxics be done for all new and renewing permits....this is a BIG deal. But they have been getting push back from Earth Justice because they do not require a Comm Risk Assessment be done.

I have been asked to provide EPA's positions on the state on our Science etc..... see below. Can you let me know who is your group might be good person to talk to and get a presentation together. I am happy to do the virtual presentation on Jan 27, 2022, but need help on putting the presentation together.

Thanks
Carol Ann

Carol Ann Cross-Davis, PhD
Epidemiologist
Air and Radiation Division
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Region III
1650 Arch Street (35D52)
Phone: (215) 814-5738
Fax: (215)814-2124
Email: gross-davis.carolann@epa.gov

From: Kassahun Sellassie <Kassahun.Sellassie@phila.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, January 04, 2022 2:12 PM
To: Gross-Davis, CarolAnn <Gross-Davis.CarolAnn@epa.gov>
Subject: Presentation on Cumulative Risk

Dr. CarolAnn Gross-Davis

As per our conversation on cumulative risk assessment, please prepare a power point presentation on:

- What is Cumulative Risk Assessment and Risk Assessment
- What it involves (Air, water, groundwater, wastes) and pathways
- EPA, States, and AMS responsibilities on cumulative risk (AMS is an air agency that only deals with air, delegation given by EPA)
- Which states or locals in USA have done Risk assessment
- NJ and AMS risk assessment are similar, and we both presented at MARAMA and various meetings (I believe you have NJ Risk assessment)
- Any EPA guidance on cumulative risk assessment
- Any difficulties to promulgate guidance and when will be the final guidance will be finalized
- The four steps for quantitative risk assessment (Haz identification, Toxic assessment, exposure assessment, and Risk Characterization)
- You can also invite another expert on Cumulative risk assessment
- Others from your perspectives.

Thanks

Kassahun Sellassie, Ph.D., P.E.
Director
Department of Public Health, AMS
321 University Avenue, 2nd Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19104
(215)685-7584
(215)685-9451 Fax

Great Minds Discuss Ideas... Small Minds Discuss People - Eleanor Roosevelt

This communication and any attachments are for intended recipients only. They may contain confidential and/or privileged information. If you are not the intended recipient, or believe you may have received this communication in error, please do not review, disclose, disseminate, distribute or duplicate it or its contents. Please notify the sender immediately by telephone or email, and delete the email and attachments without making or retaining any copy.